

HONOR AMONG THIEVES

A Zooarchaeological Study of Neandertal Ecology

MARY C. STINER

Princeton University Press

HONOR AMONG THIEVES

*A Zooarchaeological Study of
Neandertal Ecology*

MARY C. STINER

Mary Stiner uses ecological niche theory to analyze and interpret several Middle Paleolithic archaeological and paleontological sites in southern Europe. Her concern is with how the hunting, scavenging, and foraging behavior of Neandertals compared and contrasted with the subsistence behavior of other large predators living in the region at the time—lions, hyenas, and wolves, for example—and with how Neandertal subsistence behavior related to the behavior of the anatomically modern humans who subsequently came to dominate the area in the Upper Paleolithic. Her conclusion, very broadly stated, is that Neandertals entered the Middle Paleolithic in direct and successful competition with lions, hyenas, and wolves, but ended the period in direct and ultimately unsuccessful competition for the ecological niche that we came to occupy with our slightly more advanced technology and slightly more sophisticated ambush hunting strategies and techniques.

"Most of the contents of this book are new: new theoretical approaches, new methods of analysis, new analytical comparisons and a range of new behavioral interpretations. [Mary Stiner's] analytical approach is clear and rigorous, and 'scientific' in the best sense of the word."

—Paul A. Mellars, *University of Cambridge*

"An important book."

—Robert Whallon, *University of Michigan*

"By very stringent standards . . . a landmark."

—John E. Yellen, *National Science Foundation*

"Unique and unusually good."

—James F. O'Connell, *University of Utah*

Mary C. Stiner is Assistant Professor of Anthropology at the University of Arizona. She edited *Human Predators and Prey Mortality* (Westview).

Copyright © 1994 by Princeton University Press

Published by Princeton University Press, 41 William Street, Princeton, New Jersey 08540

In the United Kingdom: Princeton University Press, Chichester, West Sussex

All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Stiner, Mary C., 1955—

Honor among thieves : a zooarchaeological study of Neandertal
ecology / Mary C. Stiner.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-691-03456-7

1. Neandertals—Italy. 2. Paleolithic period—Italy. 3. Animal remains (Archaeology)—Italy. 4. Hunting, Prehistoric—Italy.
5. Paleoecology—Pleistocene. 6. Paleoecology—Italy.
7. Italy—Antiquities. I. Title.

GN285.S75 1994

937—dc20 93-45881

This book has been composed in Times Roman

Designed by Jan Lilly

Princeton University Press books are printed on acid-free paper
and meet the guidelines for permanence and
durability of the Committee on Production Guidelines for
Book Longevity of the Council on Library Resources

Printed in the United States of America

· 2 4 6 8 10 9 7 5 3 1

Contents

LIST OF FIGURES	xi	
LIST OF TABLES	xvii	
PREFACE	xxi	
CHAPTER 1. The Research Problem	3	
<i>Neandertals: People Like Us?</i>	4	
<i>The Legacy of Coexistence</i>	6	
<i>Barking Up a Good Tree</i>	9	
<i>Why Caves?</i>	10	
<i>Old Collections, New Information, and Scales of Study</i>	11	
CHAPTER 2. Theory and Organization	13	
<i>The Theory of Niche</i>	13	
<i>Analytical Approach</i>	17	
<i>Coping with Small Samples</i>	22	
CHAPTER 3. The Study Sample from Italy: Archaeology in the Context of Quaternary Studies	24	
<i>The Land</i>	24	
<i>Long before the Romans: Regional History and Geology</i>	27	
<i>Paleolithic Research in Latium</i>	29	
<i>Pontinian Mousterian Industries: The Local Solution to Raw Material Scarcity</i>	31	
<i>Human Fossils from the Latium Caves</i>	32	
<i>Dating in Italy</i>	33	
<i>The Mousterian Sample: Faunas, Sites, and Stratigraphies</i>	37	
<i>The Late Upper Paleolithic Sample</i>	61	
<i>Carnivore Dens from Upper Pleistocene Italy</i>	66	
<i>Modern Reference Cases</i>	67	
CHAPTER 4. Animal Communities and the Passage of Species	68	
<i>Taxonomic Classifications and the NISP Variable</i>	69	
<i>Counting NISP and Assemblage Comparability</i>	69	
<i>Community Complexes and Climate</i>	73	
<i>Potential Bone Collectors in the Italian Caves</i>	77	
<i>Conclusions</i>	92	
CHAPTER 5. Large Mammal Taphonomy and the Agencies of Bone Collection	95	
<i>Taphonomy Is a Bad Dog</i>	95	
<i>Methodology</i>	96	
<i>Tests of Attrition</i>	97	
<i>Damage Frequencies: Methods and Variables</i>	103	
<i>Quantitative Account of Bone Damage by Site and Vertical Provenience</i>	108	
<i>Grotta Guattari Is Not a Neandertal Ritual Chamber</i>	127	
<i>Summary of Key Damage Classes, Lithic Artifacts, and Ungulate-Carnivore Abundance</i>	130	
<i>On Distinguishing Hominid-Carnivore Feeding Sequences</i>	133	
<i>Tool Marks and Tool Sizes</i>	138	
<i>Some Distinctive Processing Signatures of Hominids versus Large Carnivores</i>	140	
<i>The Behavioral Significance of Burned Bone</i>	147	
<i>Interior Space Use and Occupation Sequences by Hominids and Carnivores</i>	150	
<i>Conclusions</i>	153	
CHAPTER 6. Small Animal Exploitation	158	
<i>Hunting by Gathering</i>	158	
<i>Methods: Taxonomy and Taphonomy</i>	159	
<i>Small Animal Species by Site and Assemblage</i>	161	

<i>Rabbits and Hares—and Canids</i>	166		
<i>Land Snails in Moscerini</i>	171		
<i>Tortoises in Moscerini</i>	174		
<i>Shellfish Exploitation in the Paleolithic: Problems and Prospects</i>	176		
<i>Marine Shellfish in Moscerini</i>	180		
<i>Aquatic Resources and Hominid Foraging Strategies</i>	189		
<i>On the Question of Species Choice</i>	192		
<i>Harvesting Intensity at Moscerini: Shellfish versus Terrestrial Resources</i>	194		
<i>Possible Seasons of Shellfish Harvesting at Moscerini</i>	196		
<i>Conclusions</i>	197		
CHAPTER 7. Species Use and Predator Guild		199	
<i>On the Meaning of Taxonomic Abundance</i>	200		
<i>Sample and Methods Review</i>	201		
<i>Taxonomic Richness: Relationships Between N-taxa and NISP</i>	206		
<i>Relative Emphases on Common Prey Species by Predators</i>	210		
<i>Resource Classes Consumed by Predators</i>	214		
<i>Overlapping Species Use: Expressions of Common Interest</i>	216		
<i>Species Consumed as Measures of Evolutionary Change</i>	217		
<i>Summary</i>	218		
CHAPTER 8. On Food Transport Behavior		219	
<i>The Problem of Food Transport</i>	220		
<i>Why Do Predators Move Food? Observations from Life</i>	221		
<i>Expectations for Transported Archaeofaunas</i>	230		
CHAPTER 9. Bone Transport, Foraging Strategies, and Predator Niches		236	
<i>Analytical Approach</i>	236		
<i>The MNE Variable: Numbers of Skeletal Elements</i>	237		
<i>Analytical Procedures and Anatomical Indexes</i>	240		
<i>Enigmatic Mousterian Faunas</i>	242		
<i>The Comparative Sample for Six Social Predators</i>	248		
			<i>Variation in Shelter Faunas Collected by Six Large Predators</i> 249
			<i>Sampling Bias and the Nature of Scavenged Faunas</i> 257
			<i>Horn- and Head-Dominant Subpatterns in Scavenged Faunas</i> 259
			<i>Foraging Specialization among Predators</i> 261
			<i>Implications of Head Collecting in the Italian Mousterian</i> 266
			<i>Conclusions</i> 267
			CHAPTER 10. On the Meaning of Mortality Patterns in Archaeofaunas 271
			<i>Predator-Prey Dynamics and Predator Evolution</i> 271
			<i>Zooarchaeological Applications of Mortality Data: Back to 1972</i> 273
			<i>Basic Age Structure Models of Life and Death</i> 274
			<i>Derivative Mortality Models</i> 277
			<i>Numbers of Age Cohorts and Mortality Profile Contours</i> 281
			<i>Scales of Observation and Classes of Information</i> 282
			<i>Seasonal Mortality in Ungulates and Its Ecological Ramifications for Predators</i> 283
			<i>Summary</i> 287
			CHAPTER 11. Mapping Predator Niches from Prey Mortality Patterns 288
			<i>Constructing Mortality Patterns from Tooth Eruption and Wear Data</i> 288
			<i>Living Population Structure and Background (Nonviolent) Mortality</i> 292
			<i>Harvesting by Carnivores in the Context of Broader Demographic Phenomena</i> 296
			<i>Human Beings, a Type of Social Ambush Predator</i> 301
			<i>The Behavioral Significance of Prime- Dominated Mortality Patterns</i> 307
			<i>Diverging Patterns of Prey Age Selection by Sympatric Predators</i> 308
			<i>Concluding Discussion</i> 312
			CHAPTER 12. Carnivore Mortality and the Denning Hypothesis 316
			<i>Age Structure Models and Denning Behavior</i> 316

<i>Tooth Eruption and Wear Classifications for Canids, Hyaenids, and Ursids</i>	320	<i>Variation in Technology</i>	362
<i>Carnivore Mortality Patterns in the Italian Caves</i>	327	<i>The Connections Between Subsistence and Technology</i>	365
<i>Conclusions</i>	330	<i>Accumulation Rates of Bones versus Stones</i>	366
CHAPTER 13. Seasons of Ungulate Procurement	332	<i>What Do Hunters Need in Order to Succeed?</i>	368
<i>Methods for Determining Seasons of Death from Deciduous Ungulate Teeth</i>	332	<i>Conclusion</i>	368
<i>Results on Seasonal Deaths in Juvenile Ungulates</i>	336	CHAPTER 15. Neandertal Niche	371
<i>Methods for Determining Seasons and Adult Sex Ratios from Deer Antler and Pearl Teeth</i>	343	<i>Faunal Results in Five Dimensions</i>	374
<i>Results on Deer Antler and Pearl Teeth</i>	345	<i>Land Use and Ranging Patterns</i>	380
<i>Conclusions</i>	349	<i>On the Role of Technology in Mousterian Subsistence: Procurement versus Processing</i>	382
CHAPTER 14. Covariation in Mousterian Technology and Game Use	352	<i>On the Meaning of Difference in Human Evolution Studies</i>	385
<i>Analytical Approach</i>	353	<i>Selection upon Variation and the Metering of Time</i>	386
<i>Variation in the Faunas</i>	358	APPENDIX	389
		LITERATURE CITED	399
		INDEX	423